Evidence brief 2: ENDS use reduces smoking

The best way to assess the evidence that ENDS use reduces smoking is to look at all the different types of evidence together. It all points towards ENDS having a powerful effect on suppressing adult smoking via five main effects:

- 1. The people who use e-cigarettes are more likely to quit smoking, and success rates increase over time as smokers become familiar with e-cigarettes as an alternative.
- 2. More people are willing to try ENDS to quit smoking because it does not require them to give up nicotine to secure significant health, welfare, and economic gains. This is easier to achieve than abstinence from nicotine.
- 3. People who would not otherwise try to quit are drawn into smoking cessation via ENDS uptake and gradual migration away from smoking. These are known as "accidental quitters".
- 4. Young adults who would otherwise have become smokers diverted into ENDS use and never started smoking.
- 5. Adults, including recent quitters, who may have relapsed to smoking turn to vaping instead.

Randomised controlled trials show ENDS to be more effective than nicotine replacement therapies and at least as good as pharmacotherapies at achieving smoking cessation in trial conditions.

- The January 2024 Cochrane review examined 88 studies and, based on seven studies that met its strict inclusion criteria, concluded that vaping nicotine was 59% more effective for quitting than nicotine patches and gum.¹
- A review of 363 studies by the UK National Institute for Health Research found that vaping was the most effective single quitting aid.²
- A 2023 Cochrane review of all smoking cessation therapies concluded that nicotine ENDS and varenicline were the two most effective treatments for quitting smoking.³

Observational and population studies. Smokers switching to ENDS are replacing cigarettes with a much lower-risk way of taking nicotine – they are making a different consumer choice rather than taking a smoking cessation medication. Smoking cessation rates using vaping *increase* over time as smokers adjust to exclusive e-cigarette use.⁴ In contrast, conventional quit approaches have *declining* quit rates over time as abstinence gives way to relapse back to smoking.⁵ Vaping is associated with increased quitting in observational studies,^{4 6 7} and population studies.^{8 9 10}

¹¹Significant use of ENDS policy is reflected in national smoking rates.^{12 13 14} Japan has seen dramatic decreases in smoking, attributable to heated tobacco products.^{15 16}

Economic data. There is also substantial evidence from economic data that ENDS function as cigarette substitutes. In a paper for FCTC COP-7, WHO concluded, "ENDS/ENNDS and cigarettes are substitutes".¹⁷ Economic evidence supports WHO's claim. There are pronounced substitution effects between combustibles such as cigarettes and smoke-free alternatives. ¹⁸ ¹⁹ ²⁰ ²¹ ²² ²³ ²⁴ ²⁵ ²⁶ Substitution should be expected: both meet user demands for nicotine, ENDS with much lower risk.

"Accidental quitters." Vaping is also the only quitting aid to assist smokers with no intention of quitting ('accidental quitters'). 27 28 29 That is important because this group is most likely to continue smoking and,

therefore, is most at risk of serious disease and premature death.

Impact versus efficacy. Controlled trials can give insights on "efficacy" (how likely someone using the product is to quit smoking. But they can't say much about how many people will use the product. ENDS have the potential for a substantial positive public health *impact*, a function of individual effectiveness multiplied by the number of people willing to try. There is evidence that ENDS have made such an impact at the population level in terms of sharper declines in cigarette smoking than originally expected. For example, US adult smoking prevalence is now lower than anticipated from pre-ENDS era trends — with the most significant declines in smoking occurring in the age groups with higher uptake of ENDS (i.e., adults under 44 years of age).³⁰

Guidance for healthcare providers. The UK National Centre for Smoking Cessation and Training produces high quality guidance in the use of vaping products to quit smoking for good.³¹

User testimony. Thousands of users provide eloquent testimony of their success in quitting smoking using ENDS. These provide compelling accounts of tobacco harm reduction at the individual level.³² Though often dismissed as anecdotes, these first-person accounts of experience are in fact rich in detail and a compelling strand of evidence that triangulates well with trials, observational data, trends and economic analysis.

References

Lindson, N., et al. (2024). Electronic cigarettes for smoking cessation. *Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews*, 1. [link]

- Lindson N. et al. (2023). Pharmacological and electronic cigarette interventions for smoking cessation in adults: component network meta-analyses. *The Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews*, *9*(9), CD015226. [link]
- Goldenson, N. I.. (2021). Switching away from Cigarettes across 12 Months among Adult Smokers Purchasing the JUUL System. *American Journal of Health Behavior*, *45*(5), 443–463 [link].
- Jackson, S. E., et al. (2019). Modelling continuous abstinence rates over time from clinical trials of pharmacological interventions for smoking cessation. *Addiction*, 114(5), 787–797. [link]
- Adriaens, K., et al. (2021). Electronic cigarettes in standard smoking cessation treatment by tobacco counselors in Flanders: E-cigarette users show similar if not higher quit rates as those using commonly recommended smoking cessation aids. *Harm Reduction Journal*, 18(1), 1–12. [link]
- Kotz, D., et al. (2022). The Effectiveness of E-Cigarettes for Smoking Cessation (Effektivitat von E-Zigaretten bei der Tabakentwohnung). *Deutsches Arzteblatt International*, 119(17), 297–301. [link]
- Chambers, M. S. (2022). Effect of vaping on past-year smoking cessation success of Australians in 2019—evidence from a national survey. *Addiction*, *117*(8), 2306–2315. [link]
- Zhuang, Y. L. et al. (2016). Long-term e-cigarette use and smoking cessation: a longitudinal study with US population. *Tobacco Control*, 25(Suppl 1), i90–i95. [link]
- Gravely, S., et al. (2022). Differences in cigarette smoking quit attempts and cessation between adults who did and did not take up nicotine vaping: Findings from the ITC four country smoking and vaping surveys. *Addictive Behaviors*, 132, 107339. [link]
- Jackson, S. et al. (2024). Associations of prevalence of e-cigarette use with quit attempts, quit success, use of smoking cessation medication, and the overall quit rate among smokers in England: A time-series analysis of population trends 2007-2022. *Nicotine & Tobacco Research*, ntae007. [link]

Thomas, K. H. et al. (2021). Smoking cessation medicines and e-cigarettes: a systematic review, network meta-analysis and cost-effectiveness analysis. *Health Technology Assessment (Winchester, England)*, 25(59), 1–224. [link]

- Office for National Statistics. Adult smoking habits in the UK: 2022. 2023. Available from: <u>UK Office for National Statistics</u>
- New Zealand Ministry of Health. Annual Health Survey 2021/22. 2023. Available from: Health New Zealand
- United States National Center for Health Statistics. Early Release of Selected Estimates Based on Data From the 2022 National Health Interview Survey. 2023. Available from: Centers for Disease Control & Prevention
- ¹⁵ Cummings, K. M., Nahhas, G. J., & Sweanor, D. T. (2020). What Is Accounting for the Rapid Decline in Cigarette Sales in Japan? *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health*, 17(10), 3570. [link]
- Stoklosa, M., Cahn, Z., Liber, A., Nargis, N., & Drope, J. (2020). Effect of IQOS introduction on cigarette sales: evidence of decline and replacement. *Tobacco Control*, 29(4), 381–387. [link]
- WHO (2016). Electronic Nicotine Delivery Systems and Electronic Non-Nicotine Delivery Systems (ENDS/ENNDS).
 Conference of the Parties to the WHO FCTC Seventh session. FCTC/COP/7/11 November 2016.
- ¹⁸ Corrigan, J. R., et al. (2020). Which smokers adopt e-cigarettes and at what price? An experimental estimation of price elasticity of demand and factors correlated with e-cigarette adoption. *Addictive Behaviors*, 105, 106324 [link].
- Stoklosa, M., Drope, J., & Chaloupka, F. J. (2016). Prices and e-cigarette demand: Evidence from the European Union. *Nicotine Tob Res*, *18*(10), 1973–1980. [link]
- Grace, R. C., Kivell, B. M., & Laugesen, M. (2015). Estimating cross-price elasticity of e-cigarettes using a simulated demand procedure. *Nicotine Tob Res*, *17*(5), 592–598. [link]
- Pesko, MF and Warman, C. The Effect of Prices on Youth Cigarette and E-Cigarette Use: Economic Substitutes or Complements? SSRN Electronic Journal. 2017 [link]
- Huang, J., et al.. (2014). The impact of price and tobacco control policies on the demand for electronic nicotine delivery systems. *Tobacco Control*, 23(suppl 3), iii41–iii47. [link]
- Abouk R, Courtemanche C, Feng B, et al. Intended and Unintended Effects of E-cigarette Taxes on Youth Tobacco Use. San Diego State University Center for Health Economics and Policy Studies, Working Paper 2021801: 2021. [link]
- Pesko, MF and Warman, C., Re-exploring the early relationship between teenage cigarette and e-cigarette use using price and tax changes (September 23, 2021). Re-exploring the early relationship between teenage cigarette and e-cigarette use using price and tax changes." Pesko MF. & Warman C. Health Economics. 2021., [link]
- Pesko MF, Courtemanche CJ, Maclean JC. The effects of traditional cigarette and e-cigarette tax rates on adult tobacco product use. *J Risk Uncertain*. 2020;60(3):229–58. [link]
- ²⁶ Cotti, C., et al. (2020). The Effects of E-Cigarette Taxes on E-Cigarette Prices and Tobacco Product Sales: Evidence from Retail Panel Data. National Bureau of Economic Research, Working Paper 26724 [link]
- Carpenter, M. J., et al. (2023). Effect of unguided e-cigarette provision on uptake, use, and smoking cessation among adults who smoke in the USA: a naturalistic, randomised, controlled clinical trial. *EClinicalMedicine*, *O*(0), 102142. [link]
- Kasza, K. A., et al. (2021). Association of e-Cigarette Use With Discontinuation of Cigarette Smoking Among Adult Smokers Who Were Initially Never Planning to Quit. *JAMA Network Open*, 4(12), e2140880–e2140880. [link]
- Foulds, J., et al. (2022). Effect of Electronic Nicotine Delivery Systems on Cigarette Abstinence in Smokers With No Plans to Quit: Exploratory Analysis of a Randomized Placebo-Controlled Trial. *Nicotine & Tobacco Research*, 24(7), 955–961. [link]
- David T. Levy, et al., US Nicotine Vaping Product SimSmoke Simulation Model: The Effect of Vaping and Tobacco Control Policies on Smoking Prevalence and Smoking-Attributable Deaths, INT. J. ENVIRON. Res. PUBLIC HEALTH 2021, 18, 4876, Results at 8, [link]
- National Centre for Smoking Cessation and Training. Vaping: a guide for health and social care professionals, November 2023 [link][PDF]
- CASAA (U.S. consumer organisation). Real stories. Real lives. User testimonials, 13,523 testimonials at 25 October 2023 [link]